

Town of Whitby Staff Report

whitby.civicweb.net



Report Title: RFP-71-2020 Prime Consultant (Architect) for the North Whitby Sports Complex (NWSC)

Report to: Committee of the Whole

Date of meeting: October 26, 2020

Report Number: CS 45-20

Department(s) Responsible:

Community Services Department
Corporate Services Department

Submitted by:

John Romano, Commissioner of
Community Services
Ann McCullough, Director, Finance and
Deputy Treasurer

Acknowledged by M. Gaskell, Chief Administrative Officer

For additional information, contact:

Catherine Bridgeman, Director Facilities
Community Services CMS-FAC
905.430.4319

Steve Walo, Capital Projects Supervisor,
905.444.1807

Kim Squires, Purchasing Analyst,
905.444.2921

1. Recommendation:

1. That the Town of Whitby accept the highest ranked proposal submitted by Perkins & Will Architecture in the amount of **\$2,746,675.01** (plus applicable taxes) for the Prime Consultant (Architect) for the North Whitby Sports Complex (NWSC); and,
2. That the Total Project Cost of **\$3,021,342.51** be approved;
3. That the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute the contract documents.

2. Highlights:

- A Request for Proposal (RFP) was issued to solicit proposals from qualified Architectural firms (the "Prime Consultant") to undertake comprehensive design services for the site planning, programming, schematic design,

design development, construction documentation, permitting, tendering and construction administration for the North Whitby Sports Complex (NWSC).

- A six member selection committee comprising of staff from CMS and ADM reviewed and evaluated proposals using a number of pre-determined criteria including: understanding of the project, background and project experience, team and qualifications, detailed schedule and staff resource matrix, price proposal, fee adjustment percentage and presentation/interviews.
- A representative from the Purchasing Division of the Corporate Services Department facilitated the process and evaluation.
- Staff recommends awarding the contract to Perkins & Will Architecture as their proposal meets and exceeds all of the evaluation criteria. Perkins & Will Architect is highly qualified and capable of completing the assignment based on their experience on assignments of similar size and scope.

3. Background:

The concept of the NWSC was first identified as part of the Sports Facility Strategy (SFS) which was approved by Council in 2015 Report [CMS 35-15](#). The SFS was undertaken to provide a comprehensive strategy to guide the planning and management of the Town's sports facilities towards the year 2031.

Building upon the SFS strategy the RFP included for the following amenities, as summarized below:

- A twin-pad arena with 85' by 190' ice pads encircled by a three-lane indoor walking/running track;
- Indoor aquatics centre with a 8 lane, 25 metre lap pool and separate leisure and therapeutic pools;
- Active Living/Wellness Studio/Multi-Purpose Space;
- Meeting rooms, arts and cultural space and studios to create a multi-faceted hub of community services in one location;
- Associated administration spaces; and
- Full site development & site servicing.

The SFS recommended the facilities be consolidated within one building while also containing non-sport components which could include meeting rooms, arts and cultural space and studios. The intent is to create a multi-faceted hub of community services in a single location.

In December 2017, Council approved a land exchange as outlined in Confidential Report CMS 51-17. The land exchange involved a Town owned parcel of land, 5.01 hectares (12.38 acres) on the east side of Baldwin Street North for a Fieldgate (Winash) Developments owned parcel of land, 5.677 hectares (14.03 acres) on the west side of Baldwin Street North, as shown on Attachment 1. The land exchange agreement was completed in September 2019.

The public and stakeholders consultation was conducted from Winter 2019 to Spring 2020 (Q4 - Q2) which included a facility concept design for the NWSC.

On June 15, 2020 Town Staff presented a Report [CMS 03-20](#) to the Committee of the Whole highlighting the various deliverables completed to date. The report was carried forward to Council on June 22, 2020 with a recommendation that Staff be directed to issue a Request for Proposal (RFP) for the selection of an Architectural firm (the "Prime Consultant) for the NWSC.

Town Staff proceeded with issuing an RFP on Bids & Tenders on July 24, 2020 to retain the Prime Consultant which includes the Architect and Sub-Consultants. The RFP closed on September 3, 2020 with a total of twelve (12) proposals submitted.

4. Discussion:

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was issued to solicit proposals from qualified Architectural firms (the "Prime Consultant") to undertake comprehensive design services for the site planning, programming, schematic design, design development, construction documentation, permitting, tendering and construction administration for the North Whitby Sports Complex.

Bids for this RFP were received until 2:00pm on September 3, 2020. The RFP was advertised on Bids and Tenders.

Proposals were received from the following firms:

- Architectural49 Inc.
- B+H Architects
- Barry Bryan Associates
- Brisbin Brook Beynon Architects
- CS&P Architects Inc.
- Diamond and Schmitt Architects Incorporated
- Lemay Co. Inc.
- MacLennan Jaunkalns Miller Architects Ltd.
- Parkin Architects Limited
- Perkins + Will Architecture
- Salter Pilon Architecture Inc.
- Triga CPM Corp

A six member selection committee comprised of staff from CMS and ADM reviewed and evaluated the proposals using the pre-determined criteria provided in the RFP document.

The following table outlines the primary considerations that were used in the evaluation of the submissions:

Criteria Number	Criteria Description	Weight/Pts Factor
1	Respondents Understanding of the Project	9
2	Respondents Background & Project Experience	30
3	Respondents Team and Qualifications	30
4	Detailed Schedule and Staff Resource Matrix	4
5	Price Proposal Fee Adjustment Percentage	25 2
6	Respondent Presentations/Interviews	10
Total		110

Staff completed the shortlisted Respondent interviews on October 1, 2020. Based on the final scoring following the Respondent interviews Staff recommends awarding the contract to **Perkins & Will Architecture** as they obtained the highest overall score based on the evaluation. Their proposal met and exceeded all of the evaluation criteria. Perkins & Will Architecture is highly qualified and capable of completing the assignment based on their experience on assignments of similar size and scope.

Perkins + Will Architecture was the Prime Consultant for the Brooklin Community Centre & Library and Whitby Central Public Library projects.

Below is a list of selective comparable projects highlighted in the proposal.

- Aaniin Community Centre and Library, Markham, Ont
- Meadowvale Community Centre & Library, Meadowvale, Ont
- Meadow Community Centre, Edmonton, Alb
- Rath Eastlink Community Centre, Truro, NS
- Minto Recreation Complex, Ottawa, Ont

5. Financial Considerations:

Estimated Project Breakdown	Amount
Proposal Amount	\$2,746,675.01
HST	\$357,067.75
Total Contract Amount	\$3,103,742.76
Rebate	(\$357,067.75)
Total Cost	\$2,746,675.01
Contingency Allowance	\$274,667.50
Total Project Cost	\$3,021,342.51

The 2020 Capital Budget included a budgetary request of \$5,200,000 to begin the planning & design process for the North Whitby Sports Complex project. Additional budget for the construction scope of work is allocated in 2021 & 2022.

The Contingency Allowance may be utilized for unallocated deliverables arising during the design and/or construction process that require additional reviews, reports and/or revisions to the Prime Consultant's base contract.

The estimated construction cost will be informed early on through the design process. Through the RFP process Respondent's identified the various factors below which will impact the overall construction cost of the project:

- Additional design measures due to COVID-19 restrictions need to be assessed with the Prime Consultant in the design phase;
- The potential District Energy Plant (DES) connectivity to the NWSC will have an impact on the overall construction cost;
- Increased costs related to achieving the sustainability initiatives; and
- Construction escalation to the year 2022 will be factored into the overall cost.

As part of the RFP process, the Prime Consultant was requested to submit a Fee Adjustment Percentage in their proposal. The Fee Adjustment Percentage was included in the Evaluation Criteria Rating Chart and would allow the Prime Consultant to be compensated on the difference between the estimated construction budget of \$40,000,000 and the actual approved tendered value. Perkins + Will included a fee adjustment of 6% of the construction cost difference which is in line with industry standards.

The proposal included for:

- LEED Gold Certification design fee;
- Zero Carbon Building (ZCB) design fee;
- The Prime Consultant will be required to provide estimates on the construction and life cycle costs for the sustainability features. These cost

estimates will enable the Town to make informed decisions on the sustainability initiatives for the overall project budget; and

- A design fee of \$110,418.38 for the sustainability initiatives is included in the Proposal Amount.

The Prime Consultant will be required to prepare cost estimates early in the design process to enable the Town to make informed decisions related to the overall project budget in terms of sustainability, life cycle and overall design criteria. Updates to the cost estimate will be provided at the major design milestones on the project and presented to the Town for review and comment.

6. Communication and Public Engagement:

Staff developed initial concepts and held key stakeholder feedback sessions. In total, 29 organizations were invited to participate in these key stakeholder feedback sessions. There were 14 groups that attended representing ice, floor and aquatics users.

At the sessions, staff provided the background that was used to develop the concept. Discussions were held around current trends and needs of the various organizations. The comments gathered will be provided to consultants awarded the project to be used as background information for the design. An Interested Parties List has been established and staff are working to develop information for the Town's website to keep residents informed throughout the process.

The development of the SFS included significant research and community consultation. The consultation informed and directed the SFS recommendations and the amenities of the proposed NWSC.

The community consultation for the SFS involved many strategies including a public survey, which received 653 respondents and targeted user group surveys with 12 groups responding. Additionally, there were 3 public information center sessions attended by over 70 people. Key informant interviews and workshops were held with stakeholders from all user groups and staff from all departments. The stakeholder focus groups were organized into 5 categories, Outdoor Sports, Indoor Sports, Emerging Sports, Youth and Older Adults; and the Seniors Committee of Council, Community Connection Executive Board of Directors, Diversity Inclusion and Advisory Committee, and Accessibility Advisory Committee were all represented at the stakeholder workshops.

Upon award, the Consultant will be required to immediately engage Town Staff and members of Council to conduct Visioning Sessions for the project. As part of the process they will review the information included in the SFS surveys and stakeholder focus group workshops. These sessions will focus on the overall programming, building, site planning and sustainability initiatives. The benefits of the Visioning Sessions will provide consensus on the various design principles for the project.

The input received from the Visioning Sessions will be incorporated into 3 design concepts. These concepts will be presented at multiple Community and Public Engagement sessions. Upon completion, Staff and the Consultant Team will present the preferred option to Council for their consideration.

The final design documentation is estimated to be ready for tender issuance in Spring 2022. Once the design documents are complete a list of prequalified general contractors will be invited to submit a bid. Staff anticipate to be in a position award the construction contract by early Summer 2022.

7. Input from Departments/Sources:

In addition to the Community Services, Corporate Services Department and CAO's Office, various departments will be engaged at strategic times in the design process to provide input.

The RFP and Proposal Evaluations were completed in conjunction with Strategic Initiatives (Sustainability).

Community Services staff will continue to work with Public Works staff to ensure the NWSC construction aligns with the construction of the mid-block arterial and connects with active transportation facilities.

A Project Steering Committee (PSC) will be formed to provide executive direction and general oversight for the development of the NWSC. The PSC will also provide leadership, guidance and direction for the planning and integration, design, construction and risk management of the project.

A Project User Committee (PUC) will also be created to provide detailed input on various aspects of the design. This includes but is not limited to the following areas:

- Aquatics, Arena and Programs & Services
- Strategic Initiatives - Sustainability
- Technology & Innovation Services (TIS)
- Building Services
- Public Works - Engineering
- Parks Operations
- Corporate Communications
- Planning & Building Departments

These internal committees will meet frequently during design and construction phases to ensure the design principles are delivered throughout the project.

8. Strategic Priorities:

a. Council Goals

The project supports many Council goals, including ensuring effective public engagement and consultation by continuing the public consultation and information sharing throughout the project. By involving staff from across the organization the project will engage staff to solve problems and deliver the best results to residents. This engagement of staff and rigorous oversight of the project will ensure sound financial management and respect for the taxpayer. The project

helps support building complete and walkable communities so that Whitby remains the community of choice for families and increases recreational opportunities for residents and tourists.

The development of the NWSC is identified in the 2020 - 2022 Business Plan under the Community Building category. The project aligns with the Customer Corporate Strategic Priority as the project will help ensure there are facilities that can accommodate the growing community's demand for indoor recreation opportunities. The first step in achieving an accessible and sustainable sports centre is ensuring the RFP for the design consultant prioritizes experience with the design of accessible and sustainable recreation centres.

b. Accessibility

Accessibility will be considered throughout the project and consulted with the Town's Accessibility Advisory Committee. The project design in its entirety shall meet or exceed the requirements of the Ontario with Disabilities Act (AODA).

c. Sustainability

The new Whitby Green Standard is aimed to develop a more sustainable community and support Whitby's goal to reduce Green House Gas emissions.

This project will include sustainability principles from the Whitby Green Standard in the overall design resulting in a high performance building. The sustainable design strategies will be informed through the design process and cost estimates will be provided by the Prime Consultant. These cost estimates will enable the Town to make informed decisions in the early design phase of the project. The sustainable design principles include the following:

1. Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) rating system for LEED Gold Certification; and
2. Canada Green Building Council's (CaGBC) Zero Carbon Building Standard (ZCB) certification.
3. Brooklin Urban Design and Sustainable Development Guidelines; and
4. Brooklin Community Secondary Plan.

9. Attachments:

N/A